

Exploring the barriers to the introduction of a best practice nutrition and dietetics service model in rural areas

Leanne Julie Brown

BHSc (N&D), Grad Cert Paed Nutr Diet, Grad Cert Sports Nutr

A thesis submitted for the degree of PhD (Nutrition and Dietetics)

March 2009

Statement of Originality

The thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University library, being made available for loan and photocopying subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

.....

Leanne Brown

Acknowledgement of Collaboration

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this dissertation has been done in collaboration with other researchers. I have included as part of the dissertation a statement clearly outlining the extent of collaboration, with whom and under what auspices.

.....

Leanne Brown

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my supervisors:

Firstly, Professor Sandra Capra for her vision, enthusiasm and encouragement throughout this research process. I have been inspired her boundless energy and enthusiasm for research and the dietetic profession.

Secondly, Dr Lauren Williams for her expert, detailed advice and excellent editing skills. I am particularly grateful for her support with qualitative data analysis and the writing up qualitative results. Lauren provided me with support and encouragement when it was needed most.

I would also like to acknowledge the support and assistance provided by:

Ms Sue Cassidy and Ms Elizabeth Ferres at the Dietitians Association of Australia (DAA) National Office for the provision of de-identified DAA workforce data.

The staff and patients of the Oncology Clinic at Tamworth Rural Referral Hospital for their support and participation in this research. The dietitians and other health professionals in the Hunter New England Health area who have participated in this research. I would particularly like to thank Deanne Harris and Elesa Crowley for their participation and support.

My colleagues at the University Department of Rural Health Northern NSW who have provided valuable advice and encouragement along the way. I would particularly like to thank Jennifer Lang for her support with providing resources and Colette McLaren for her expert technical support.

I would also like to thank all of my research assistants who have helped with a range of research activities: Mia Winterton, Cathy Viertel, Amanda Horne and Rebecca Martin. Mr Nic Croce for his expert statistical advice.

Last of all, but very importantly friends, family and Bob Scherf for their love, support and encouragement.

Abbreviations and Acronyms

The following is a list of the most commonly used abbreviations and acronyms used throughout this thesis.

ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACT	Australian Capital Territory
AH	Allied Health
AIHW	Australian Institute of Health and Welfare
APD	Accredited Practising Dietitian
ANZSCO	Australian New Zealand Standard Classification of Organisations
ARIA	Accessibility/Remoteness Index of Australia
ASGC	Australian Standard Geographical Classification
BHC	Better Health Commission
BMI	Body Mass Index
CDM	Chronic Disease Management
CHIS	Community Health Information System
CHIME	Community Health Information Management Enterprise
CINAHL	Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature
CPD	Continuing Professional Development
CPE	Continuing Professional Education
DAA	Dietitians Association of Australia
DHHS	Department of Health and Human Services
DOHRS	Department of Health Reporting System
EPC	Enhanced Primary Care
F/T	Full-time
FTE	Full-time equivalent
GP	General practitioner
HNEH	Hunter New England Health
HP	Health professional
IT	Information Technology
ICT	Information and communication technology
MAHS	More Allied Health Services
MCAS	Modified Constipation Assessment Scale
NI	Nutritional Intervention
NRRAHAS	National Rural and Remote Allied Advisory Service

NSW	New South Wales
NT	Northern Territory
NZ	New Zealand
OT	Occupational Therapist
OOS	Occasions of service
PG-SGA	Patient generated Subjective Global Assessment
PHC	Primary Health Care
PHCRED	Primary Health Care Research and Education Development
P/T	Part-time
PT	Physiotherapist
Qld	Queensland
QLQ-C30	Quality of life questionnaire - C30
QOL	Quality of Life
RR	Response rate
SARRAH	Services for Australian Rural and Remote Allied Health
SA	South Australia
SED	Socioeconomic disadvantage
SGA	Subjective Global Assessment
SP	Speech Pathologist
Tas	Tasmania
TCA	Team Care Arrangements
TRRH	Tamworth Rural Referral Hospital
UANOVA	Univariate Analysis of Variance
UC	Usual care
UDRH	University Department of Rural Health
UK	United Kingdom
USA	United States of America
Vic	Victoria
WA	Western Australia
WTE	Whole Time Equivalent

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	i
Abbreviations and Acronyms	ii
Index of Figures	vi
Index of Tables	vii
Preface	ix
Abstract	x
Background to this thesis	1
Chapter One: Literature review	5
1.0 Introduction	5
1.1 Background	5
1.2 Search strategy	8
1.3 Literature Review: Benchmarking and best practice for dietetic services ..	10
1.4 Literature Review: Rural allied health workforce	12
1.5 Literature Review: Rural allied health recruitment and retention	19
1.6 Literature Review: Rural allied health staffing models	26
1.7 Theoretical model	31
1.8 Aims and research questions	33
1.9 Conclusions	41
Chapter Two Study One: The Australian dietetic workforce 1991-2006	42
2.0 Introduction	42
2.1 Background	42
2.2 Aims	43
2.3 Sources of data: The dietetics workforce in Australia 1991 – 2006	43
2.4 Methods	46
2.5 Analysis	47
2.6 Results	47
2.7 Discussion	63
2.8 Conclusions	70
2.9 Summary	70
Chapter Three Study Two: Case study of six rural sites in NSW – aims, methods and analysis	71
3.0 Introduction	71
3.1 Background	71
3.2 Overall Aims	72
3.3 Method	73
3.4 Analysis	79
3.5 Summary	81
Chapter Four Study Two: Results – history and characteristics	82
4.0 Introduction	82
4.1 Document analysis	83
4.2 Individual interview data	84
4.3 Discussion	133
4.4 Conclusions	140
4.5 Summary	140
Chapter Five Study Two: Results - barriers and drivers	141
5.0 Introduction	141
5.1 Document analysis data	141
5.2 Individual interview data	144
5.3 Discussion	166
5.4 Conclusions	169
5.5 Summary	169
Chapter Six Study Two: Results - gaps and opportunities	170
6.0 Introduction	170
6.1 Individual interview data	171

6.2 Discussion	182
6.3 Conclusions	185
6.4 Summary	185
Chapter Seven Study Three: Best practice dietetic services in a rural area - oncology case study	186
7.0 Introduction	186
7.1 Background	186
7.2 Literature Review: Dietetic outpatient services for oncology patients	187
7.3 Aims	192
7.4 Method	192
7.5 Results	196
7.6 Discussion	202
7.7 Conclusion	206
7.8 Summary	207
Chapter Eight: Discussion and Conclusions	208
8.0 Introduction	208
8.1 Research questions and hypotheses addressed	208
8.2 Post Script: Recent workforce changes	214
8.3 Implications of recent developments in the NSW allied health workforce	215
8.4 Recommendations	217
8.5 Suggestions for further research	219
8.6 Summary	220
References	221
Appendix 1: Definitions, classifications and structures	238
Appendix 1.1: Definitions and classifications of rural	238
Appendix 1.2: Public health service funding and structures	241
Appendix 1.3: Search terms for literature review	244
Appendix 1.4: Influences on the development of a best practice rural dietetic service	245
Appendix 2: Ethics	250
Appendix 2.1: Ethics approval case study six sites	250
Appendix 2.2: Information Statement One	252
Appendix 2.3: Information Statement Two	254
Appendix 2.4: Consent Form One	256
Appendix 2.5: Consent Form Two	257
Appendix 2.6: Ethics approval - oncology service delivery case study	258
Appendix 2.7: Information Form - oncology service delivery case study	260
Appendix 2.8: Consent Form - oncology service delivery case study	262
Appendix 3: Data collection forms	263
Appendix 3.1: Semi-structured Individual Interview Protocol 1	263
Appendix 3.2: Semi-structured Individual Interview Protocol 2	264
Appendix 3.3: Semi-structured Individual Interview Protocol 3	265
Appendix 3.4: Semi-structured Individual Interview Protocol 4	266
Appendix 3.5 Employment details for dietetic positions form	267
Appendix 3.6: Occasions of service data form	268
Appendix 3.7: PG-SGA	269
Appendix 3.8: QLQ-C30	271
Appendix 3.9: Modified Constipation Assessment Scale	273
Appendix 3.10: Patient satisfaction questionnaire	274
Appendix 3.11 Patient feedback questionnaire	275
Appendix 4: Research publications	276
Appendix 4.1: Publications arising from this thesis	276
Appendix 4.2: Dietetics workforce article	278
Appendix 4.3: Dietetics best practice service delivery article	292
Appendix 4.4: Statement of Collaboration	299

Index of Figures

Figure 1: Australian population distribution, June 2006	3
Figure 2: Theoretical model.....	32
Figure 3: Theoretical hypotheses diagram	37
Figure 4: Sequential explanatory mixed methods design	38
Figure 5: Continuum of triangulation in mixed methods research.....	40
Figure 6: Year of graduation of Dietitian Association of Australia members.....	61
Figure 7: Location of new graduate Dietitians Association of Australia members...	62
Figure 8: Multiple regression model for length of stay in a rural position	80
Figure 9: Length of service by individuals in health service and Division of GP positions	83
Figure 10: Hunter New England Area Health Service map	89
Figure 11: Case study timeline Site A: 1991-2006.....	92
Figure 12: Case study timeline Site B: 1991-2006.....	93
Figure 13: Case study timeline Site C: 1991-2006.....	94
Figure 14: Case study timeline Site D: 1991-2006.....	95
Figure 15: Case study timeline Site E: 1991-2006	96
Figure 16: Case study timeline Site F: 1991-2006	97
Figure 17: Increase in dietetic staffing across the six sites for health service and Division of GP services	142
Figure 18: Theoretical model with evidence supported by findings	213

Index of Tables

Table 1: Cause of death as a percentage of excess deaths in inner and outer regional areas of Australia 2002-04	2
Table 2: Dietitians per 100 000 population in 1986	11
Table 3: Allied health workforce in rural areas literature	15
Table 4: Factors linked to recruitment and retention of rural allied health professionals	19
Table 5: Allied health recruitment and retention literature	21
Table 6: Allied health rural staffing models literature	27
Table 7: Overview of research studies contributing to thesis	36
Table 8: Case study strategies for four research design tests	39
Table 9: Number of practising dietitians per 100 000 population for states and territories from Census data	49
Table 10: Number of practising dietitians by age and gender, 2001	50
Table 11: Hours of work reported by practising dietitians, 1996, 2001	51
Table 12: Hours of work of DAA members 2003, 2004, 2006	52
Table 13: Income levels of practising dietitians, 1996 and 2001	54
Table 14: Work categories of DAA national membership	55
Table 15: Locations of dietitians by ASGC remoteness classification from 2001 Census data	57
Table 16: Dietitians employed in the health workforce by ASGC remoteness structure regions in each state or territory	59
Table 17: Dietitians in public versus private practice for ASGC remoteness structure regions by state or territory	60
Table 18: Validity in case study mixed methods research	72
Table 19: Summary of demographic and service details for the six sites	74
Table 20: Interviewees by site and interview protocol	84
Table 21: Characteristics of the dietitians interviewed and details of their employment	85
Table 22: Summary of six rural sites of dietetic service delivery in 2006	87
Table 23: Dietetic services provided by dietitians in each site in 2006	99
Table 24: Occasion of service data in the six sites in 2006	100
Table 25: Summary of recruitment and retention themes	103
Table 26: Matrix database of qualitative themes by site	128
Table 27: Linking staffing levels and quotes for convergent validation	130
Table 28: Linking dietetic management and quotes for convergent validation	131
Table 29: Linking graded positions and quotes for convergent validation	132
Table 30: Dietetic service and staffing levels at six rural sites	143

Table 31: Summary of themes for the development of positions	152
Table 32: Linking staffing increases with management attitudes for convergent validation of themes.....	165
Table 33: Summary of public and private sector staffing in six sites in 2006.....	173
Table 34: EPC consultation figures for private practice dietitians (2004-2007) in Divisions of GP and corresponding to study sites	174
Table 35: Linking private practice numbers with quotes for convergent validation	180
Table 36: Dietetic interventions with oncology patients	189
Table 37: Features of a best practice dietetic service model and usual care service	194
Table 38: Baseline characteristics for 18 rural oncology patients undergoing chemotherapy	198
Table 39: Comparison of intervention and control groups at baseline and after 8 weeks	200
Table 40: Characteristics of a model for a best practice dietetic service for rural patients with cancer undergoing chemotherapy.....	205
Table 41: Examples of locations by the Australian Standard Geographical Classification categories.....	240
Table 42: Influences on the development of a best practice dietetic service in rural areas	245

Preface

In order to ensure rigour in qualitative research it is important that researchers are able to reflect on and acknowledge the influence of their own views and experiences and how these may influence the data collection and interpretation (Mathers and Huang 2004). Reflexivity refers to the ongoing examination of what is known and how it is known “to have an ongoing conversation about experience while simultaneously living in the moment” (Hertz 1997). According to Patton reflexivity requires the qualitative researcher to be aware of their own perspectives (cultural, political, social, linguistic and ideological) and that of the research interview participants (Patton 2002).

As the author of this manuscript it is important that I acknowledge my current position as a Lecturer in Nutrition and Dietetics at the University Department of Rural Health Northern New South Wales. In this position I have worked closely with the rural based dietitians in the area under study for the past five years. In this role I have been responsible for providing clinical outpatient services, continuing education for local dietitians and support for student placements. In this role I am known to many local dietitians and some of those interviewed in this research were known to me prior to the research being conducted.

Prior to my current appointment I worked for a period of eight years in clinical dietetic positions, primarily in urban areas. This non-rural clinical background provides me with a different perspective which gives me an awareness of the differences between rural and metropolitan dietetic services and practice. In order to maximise the accuracy and objectivity of the data, aspects of the qualitative and quantitative data were triangulated. Field notes were recorded throughout the process of obtaining qualitative data and a second non-rural based researcher provided double coding of the interview themes. These methodological processes were designed to ensure the rigour of this research.

Abstract

This body of research explores the barriers that exist to the introduction of best practice models for dietetics services in rural areas of Australia. Best practice in this thesis refers to workforce staffing and organisational best practice, rather than clinical best practice. For the purpose of this thesis a best practice dietetic service has been defined as *a timely, accessible, up-to-date nutrition and dietetic service that is effective in meeting the identified needs of the community* based on a quality health service definition (Halton 2005). There is no known previous research that has investigated the elements of a best practice dietetics staffing model and the factors that support or inhibit the development of a best practice dietetic service model in rural areas. A review of the literature was conducted to determine the potential features of a best practice dietetic service for rural areas and the factors that are known to affect the development of a best practice service. A theoretical model of best practice dietetic services for rural areas was tested using a series of case studies. An exploratory sequential mixed methods approach has been used in six case study sites to investigate the barriers to best practice using rural sites in northern New South Wales (NSW), Australia as the setting. The mixed method multiple case study investigated the dietetics workforce characteristics and development in the study sites. Best practice dietetic service delivery was tested with cancer patients using the implementation and evaluation of best practice dietetic clinical guidelines in a rural setting. Key findings from this research include: retention issues related to a lack of management support, limited career pathways and professional isolation. Key drivers for the creation of dietetics positions included the actions of champions and the support of management. The main barriers to the creation of positions included a general lack of funds and competing priorities. The outcomes of this research are important for future workforce planning for dietitians in rural areas.

